


# ***GSTR 2007/D3 - Goods and services tax: GST and bare trusts***

 This cover sheet is provided for information only. It does not form part of *GSTR 2007/D3 - Goods and services tax: GST and bare trusts*

There is an Erratum notice for this document.

This document has been finalised.



## Draft Goods and Services Tax Ruling

### Goods and services tax: GST and bare trusts

---

| Contents                         | Para      |
|----------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>What this Ruling is about</b> | <b>1</b>  |
| <b>Date of effect</b>            | <b>9</b>  |
| <b>Background</b>                | <b>11</b> |
| <b>Legislative context</b>       | <b>14</b> |
| <b>Ruling with explanation</b>   | <b>24</b> |
| <b>Your comments</b>             | <b>82</b> |
| <b>Detailed contents list</b>    | <b>83</b> |

#### ***Preamble***

This publication is a draft for public comment. It represents the Commissioner's preliminary view about the way the law applies. It is not a ruling or advice for the purposes of section 105-60 of Schedule 1 to the *Taxation Administration Act 1953*. You can rely on this publication to provide you with protection from interest and penalties as follows. If a statement turns out to be incorrect and you underpay your tax as a result, you will not have to pay a penalty. Nor will you have to pay interest on the underpayment provided you reasonably relied on the publication in good faith. However, even if you don't have to pay a penalty or interest, you will have to pay the correct amount of tax provided the time limits under the law allow it.

## **What this Ruling is about**

---

1. This Ruling explains how the *A New Tax System (Goods and Services Tax) Act 1999* (GST Act) applies to transfers of property involving bare trusts and similar trusts where the trustee has limited active duties and acts solely at the direction of the beneficiary or beneficiaries.
2. In particular, the Ruling considers the circumstance where an entity, in the course of its enterprise, causes the trustee of property (held on a bare trust for the entity) to transfer the property to a third party.
3. This Ruling also considers the GST issues that may arise in the formation and termination of the trust, and notes how the views expressed in relation to these matters interact with the tax invoice, margin scheme and going concern provisions.
4. This Ruling applies only to bare trusts created intentionally by written instrument or where the creation of the trust is expressly recorded, including trusts created by deed or declaration of trust or where the creation of the trust is recorded in the minutes of a meeting of the trustee and settlor of the trust, or in a resolution of the trustee.<sup>1</sup>
5. This Ruling does not deal with transactions in relation to trust property where the activities of the trust amount to the trust carrying on an enterprise involving the trust property.
6. This Ruling does not deal with managed investment schemes.

---

<sup>1</sup> This restriction in the scope of the Ruling does not imply that the principles in the Ruling do not extend to undocumented arrangements. Such arrangements would need to be considered on their facts.

7. This Ruling sets out the Commissioner's views in the context of the GST Act. Nothing in this Ruling can be taken as applying to bare trusts in other contexts, such as income tax or fringe benefits tax.

8. All legislative references in this Ruling are to the GST Act, unless indicated otherwise.

## Date of effect

---

9. This draft Ruling represents the preliminary, though considered view of the Australian Taxation Office. This draft may not be relied on by taxpayers or practitioners. When the final Ruling is officially released, it will explain our view of the law as it applies both before and after its date of issue.

10. The final Ruling will be a public ruling for the purposes of section 105-60 of Schedule 1 to the *Taxation Administration Act 1953* and may be relied upon, after it is issued, by any entity to which it applies. Goods and Services Tax Ruling GSTR 1999/1 explains the GST rulings system and our view of when you can rely on our interpretation of the law in GST public and private rulings.

## Background

---

11. An entity (B) that carries on an enterprise may, for reasons of convenience or anonymity, arrange for an asset which is to be used in its enterprise to be acquired by another entity (T) to hold on trust for B. T may hold the asset on trust for B under a bare trust – that is, subject to an obligation to transfer legal title to the asset to B, or to a third party if B so directs, and with no other active duties to perform.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> In *Herdegen v. Federal Commissioner of Taxation* 88 ATC 4995, Gummow J said at 5003:

Today the usually accepted meaning of 'bare' trust is a trust under which the trustee or trustees hold property without any interest therein, other than that existing by reason of the office and the legal title as trustee, and without any duty or further duty to perform, except to convey it upon demand to the beneficiary or beneficiaries or as directed by them, for example, on sale to a third party. The beneficiary may of course hold the equitable interest upon a sub-trust for others or himself and others: see *Halsbury's Laws of England*, 4th ed., Vol. 48, 'Trusts', para. 938. The term is usually used in relation to trusts created by express declaration. But it has been said that the assignor under an agreement for value for assignment of so-called 'future' property becomes, on acquisition of the title to the property, trustee of that property for the assignee (*Palette Shoes Pty Ltd v. Krohn* (1937) 58 CLR 1 at p. 27) and this trust would answer the description of a bare trust. Also, the term 'bare trust' may be used fairly to describe the position occupied by a person holding the title to property under a resulting trust flowing from the provision by the beneficiary of the purchase money for the property.

12. Alternatively, the trust may not strictly be a bare trust, because the trustee has minor active duties to perform, but nevertheless the trustee is required to act at the direction of the beneficiary in dealing with title to the trust property. Where this draft Ruling refers to 'bare trusts' it should also be taken to refer to trusts of this kind which may not strictly fall within accepted definitions of bare trusts but share similar features. This would, for instance, include situations in which the trustee is obliged to pay for minor repairs with funds provided by the beneficiary. It is also accepted that the trustee may execute documents relating to the trust property at the direction of the beneficiary.

13. An example of an arrangement where a bare trust may be created is where a partnership<sup>3</sup> (B) of entities decides to acquire and develop real property for sale. The partners may not wish to disclose their names to the vendor of the property and so arrange for a company (T) that they control to acquire title to the property. If there is a large number of partners, it may also be more convenient for the partnership to have a single company that can execute legal documents associated with the acquisition, development and disposal of the property. T acquires and holds the legal title to the property on trust for B. T has no discretion regarding the use and disposal of the trust property and deals with it solely at the direction of B.

## **Legislative context**

---

14. In applying the GST Act, it is relevant to identify the supplier, the recipient, and whether or not the supply is in the course of carrying on an enterprise.

15. The GST Act treats a trust as an entity.<sup>4</sup> It does not distinguish between bare trusts and other types of trusts and there are no special rules for bare trusts.

16. The definitions of supply<sup>5</sup> and of acquisition<sup>6</sup> are very wide.

---

<sup>3</sup> While a partnership has been chosen for this example, the principles it illustrates apply to other entities, such as companies, that may enter into bare trust arrangements.

<sup>4</sup> Paragraph 184-1(1)(g).

<sup>5</sup> Section 9-10.

<sup>6</sup> Section 11-10.

# GSTR 2007/D3

17. Central to the operation of the GST Act is the concept of carrying on an enterprise.<sup>7</sup> It is one of the elements required to be satisfied for the making of a taxable supply under section 9-5 which relevantly states:

You make a **taxable supply** if:

- (a) you make the supply for \*consideration; and
- (b) the supply is made in the course or furtherance of an \*enterprise that you carry on; and

...

18. 'Carrying on an enterprise' is also a necessary requirement for the making of a creditable acquisition under section 11-5 which relevantly states:

You make a **creditable acquisition** if:

- (a) you acquire anything solely or partly for a \*creditable purpose; and

...

19. In turn, subsection 11-15(1) provides:

You acquire a thing for a **creditable purpose** to the extent that you acquire it in \*carrying on your \*enterprise.

20. In order for an input tax credit to which you are entitled for a creditable acquisition to be attributed to a tax period, you generally must hold a tax invoice<sup>8</sup> that complies with the GST Act and its regulations.

21. The requirements for a document to be a tax invoice are contained in section 29-70 and its corresponding regulations.

22. Division 75 sets out special rules for supplies of real property under the margin scheme. For the margin scheme to apply, it is a condition that the supplier and the recipient have agreed in writing that the margin scheme is to apply.<sup>9</sup>

23. Subdivision 38-J sets out special rules for the GST-free supply of a going concern. For this exemption to apply, it is a requirement that the supplier and recipient have agreed in writing that the supply is of a going concern.

---

<sup>7</sup> 'Enterprise' is defined in section 9-20. Section 195-1 provides that carrying on an enterprise includes doing anything in the course of the commencement or termination of an enterprise.

<sup>8</sup> Subsection 29-10(3).

<sup>9</sup> Subsection 75-5(1). However, for supplies made under contracts entered into before 29 June 2005, or made pursuant to rights or options granted before that day, such a written agreement is not required.

---

## **Ruling with explanation**

---

24. This Ruling deals with transactions involving bare trusts mainly in a way that does not rely on a finding of agency. However, it is recognised that some transactions may involve an entity dealing with property in an agency capacity even though the entity holds the legal title to the property on trust. The general principles of agency are dealt with here only briefly so far as necessary to distinguish transactions that, although involving an entity that holds property under a bare trust, are able to be analysed by reference to agency principles.

### **General principles – agency**

25. Agency is a relationship under which an intermediary is authorised by another party to do something on behalf of that other party. The intermediary is called an agent and the party who authorises the agent to act on their behalf is called the principal. Agency is discussed in Goods and Services Tax Ruling GSTR 2000/37 Goods and services tax: agency relationships and the application of the law.

26. In some circumstances, having regard to the terms of the documents governing the creation of the trust, the trustee's obligations, the terms of any agreement between the parties and all other relevant circumstances, it may be established that in a particular transaction an entity deals with the trust property in the capacity of agent for B. This may be so even though the trustee holds the legal title to the trust property on trust for B. For instance, the documents may expressly provide that the trustee is to deal with the property as agent for B. In those circumstances, if the actions of the parties are consistent with the express terms, the trustee may acquire or supply the property as agent for B.

27. This is unlikely to occur in the case of a strict bare trust, where the only obligation of the trustee is to transfer title to the trust property to B or to a third party at B's direction. In those circumstances, any transfer of title to the property is likely to be pursuant to the trustee's trust obligation rather than as agent for B. However, it may occur in circumstances where B has expressly empowered the entity that holds or is to hold the legal title to property on trust to act as B's agent in relation to the acquisition or disposal of the property.

28. Where property is acquired or supplied as agent for another, normal agency principles apply. This means that the acquisition or supply is made by the principal, not the agent, and subject to special rules (Subdivision 153-B), it is the principal that has the relevant obligations and entitlements under the GST Act in relation to the supply or acquisition. This is so even though the legal title to the property is held by the trustee on trust for B.

## General principles – bare trusts

29. A bare trust arrangement does not in itself create the relationship of agency between the trustee and beneficiary. An entity acting in its capacity as trustee does not contract as agent for the beneficiary of the trust but as principal.<sup>10</sup> Accordingly, transactions involving a bare trust, without more, need to be analysed in a way that does not rely on a finding of agency.

30. In applying the GST law to the disposal of an asset held on a bare trust, the question arises as to which entity makes the relevant supply – the trust or the beneficiary.

31. In resolving that question, it is necessary to have regard to the scheme of the GST Act.

32. For a supply to be a taxable supply under section 9-5, the entity making the supply must do so in the course or furtherance of an enterprise it carries on. Similarly, an entity makes an acquisition for a creditable purpose under section 11-15 to the extent that the entity makes the acquisition in carrying on its enterprise.

33. It follows from these provisions that the GST Act concerns itself with supplies and acquisitions by entities in the course or furtherance of, or in carrying on, their enterprises.

34. The term ‘enterprise’ is relevantly<sup>11</sup> defined in subsection 9-20(1) as follows:

An **enterprise** is an activity, or series of activities, done:

- (a) in the form of a \*business; or
- (b) in the form of an adventure or concern in the nature of trade; or
- (c) on a regular or continuous basis, in the form of a lease, licence or other grant of an interest in property; or ...

35. Subsection 184-1(1) treats a trust as an entity. Subsection 184-1(2) goes on to note that the trustee of a trust is taken to be an entity consisting of the person who is the trustee at any given time. Subsection 184-1(3) confirms that a legal person can have a number of different capacities in which the person does things and in each of those capacities the person is taken to be a different entity.

<sup>10</sup> Per Millett LJ in *Ingram v. Inland Revenue Commissioners* [1997] 4 All ER 395 at 427 who seems to be referring to a trustee he regards as a bare trustee.

<sup>11</sup> Paragraphs (d) to (h) of the definition of enterprise have no application to a bare trustee.

36. These provisions as applied to a trust do not create two separate entities – the trust and the trustee – but rather the relevant entity is the trust, with the trustee standing as that entity when a legal person is required.<sup>12</sup> However, it is necessary to distinguish between the entity that is the trustee acting in that capacity, which stands as the trust where a legal person is required, and the entity acting in its own right.

37. The activities of a bare trustee are essentially passive in nature. A trustee of the type of trust considered in this Ruling has either no active duties to perform or only minor active duties. A bare trust as that term is used in this Ruling does not carry on an enterprise for GST purposes.<sup>13</sup>

38. On the other hand, a beneficiary of a bare trust may carry on an enterprise involving an asset held on trust for the beneficiary by the bare trustee. For instance, in the example at paragraph 11 of this draft Ruling, despite legal title to the property being held by T, the property is used by B in carrying on its enterprise.

39. If the asset is sold, the transaction will involve a transfer of the legal title to the property to a third party by the trustee at the direction of the beneficiary.

40. The definition of ‘taxable supply’ concerns itself with supplies made in the course of an enterprise. It is the entity which conducts that enterprise that makes the relevant supply. In other words, if T transfers legal title to the property to a third party at the direction of B, it is B that causes the supply to be made in the course of its enterprise and is liable for GST, if the other requirements for a taxable supply in section 9-5 are met.<sup>14</sup>

41. There is nothing in the GST Act which requires or implies that legal title to the assets of an enterprise must be held or dealt with by the entity carrying on the enterprise in order for taxable supplies or creditable acquisitions in respect of the assets to be made.

<sup>12</sup> Paragraph 72, Miscellaneous Tax Ruling MT 2006/1 The New Tax System: the meaning of entity carrying on an enterprise for the purposes of entitlement to an Australian Business Number.

<sup>13</sup> Although an entity that is the trustee of a bare trust does not deal with the trust property in its capacity as trustee in the course of an enterprise that it carries on, the entity in its own right may receive consideration for its trustee services. In this capacity it may be carrying on an enterprise and entitled to register for GST purposes and be entitled to input tax credits on creditable acquisitions which relate to the trustee services. In those circumstances, the entity would also be liable for GST on the supply of the trustee services.

<sup>14</sup> Similarly, in the case of input taxed and GST-free supplies, if, in the course or furtherance of its enterprise, B causes T to transfer the legal title to trust property held under a bare trust, it is B that makes the input taxed or GST-free supply. However, this analysis is restricted to the bare trust circumstances dealt with in this Ruling. It does not follow that in every case where an entity (A) causes another entity (B) to do something, A makes the supply of the thing done by B.

# GSTR 2007/D3

42. These conclusions appear to accord with the usual commercial practice in accounting for GST. They also accord with the approach to interpreting the GST Act adopted by Stone J in *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T (Sterling Guardian)*<sup>15</sup> as discussed below.

43. In analysing a transaction for GST purposes, regard must be given to the true character of the arrangement in which the transaction arises and all the facts and circumstances surrounding it. While the legal form of a transaction is relevant, support for not unduly focussing on the legal interests in transactions involving land can be found in the *Sterling Guardian*,<sup>16</sup> and *Saga Holidays Limited v. Commissioner of Taxation (Saga Holidays)*<sup>17</sup> and in United Kingdom value added tax cases.

44. In *Sterling Guardian*, Stone J said:

The clear thrust of the GST Act, both in its wording and as explained in the EM, is that of a practical business tax imposed with respect to elements of commerce. As Senior Counsel for the respondent pointed out, although in economic terms the burden of the GST is borne by the ultimate consumer, in terms of 'imposition, collection and administration' it is a tax on business. It is for the taxpayer to prepare business activity statements and pay the appropriate GST and in this context abstract propositions about interests in land and the acquisition of a brand new set of rights arising from registration of a strata plan are irrelevant.<sup>18</sup>

45. Her Honour's approach was upheld on appeal by the Full Federal Court.<sup>19</sup>

46. The practical business approach to GST as described by Stone J was confirmed by the Full Federal Court in *Saga Holidays*.<sup>20</sup> Stone J, with whom the other members of the Full Court agreed, saw this as part of the context for the interpretation of the GST legislation. Her Honour also regarded the approach of Lord Hoffman in *Beynon and Partners v. Customs and Excise Commissioners (Beynon)*<sup>21</sup> in focussing on the 'social and economic reality' of a transaction.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>15</sup> *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2005] FCA 1166; [2005] ATC 4796; [2005] 60 ATR 502; *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2006] FCAFC 12; [2006] ATC 4227; [2006] 62 ATR 119.

<sup>16</sup> *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2005] FCA 1166; *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2006] FCAFC 12.

<sup>17</sup> *Saga Holidays Limited v. Commissioner of Taxation* [2006] FCAFC 191.

<sup>18</sup> *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2005] FCA 1166; (2005) ATC 4796; (2005) 60 ATR 502 at paragraph 39.

<sup>19</sup> *Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC of T* [2006] FCAFC 12.

<sup>20</sup> *Saga Holidays Limited v. Commissioner of Taxation* [2006] FCAFC 191 at [29].

<sup>21</sup> *Beynon and Partners v. Customs and Excise Commissioners* [2005] 1 WLR 86.

<sup>22</sup> *Saga Holidays Limited v. Commissioner of Taxation* [2006] FCAFC 191 at [43]. The Full Federal Court also considered the 'social and economic reality approach' in its decision in *Reliance Carpet Company Pty Ltd v. Federal Commissioner of Taxation* [2007] FCAFC 99, from which the Commissioner has sought special leave to appeal to the High Court.

***A cycle of transactions***

47. That these conclusions give practical effect to the GST Act may be evidenced by examining a cycle of transactions in the context of a bare trust arrangement.

We illustrate this with the following example:

- (1) B carries on a land development enterprise.
- (2) B wishes to purchase some land on which it will erect a strata titled residential unit development. However, for reasons of anonymity, B acquires a shelf company (T) to act as bare trustee for B in the acquisition of the land. T executes a declaration of trust under which it declares that if it acquires title to the land it will hold the title to the land, and any strata titled units to be constructed on the land, on a bare trust for B and act at all times only at the direction of B in respect of the land and units.
- (3) T enters into a contract for the acquisition of the land from S. B provides the monies<sup>23</sup> to enable T to complete the contract. T becomes the legal owner of the land but holds the title to the land on trust for B.
- (4) B arranges for the unit development to be constructed, engaging all contractors and meeting all costs. Where documents are required to be signed by the legal owner of the land, for instance to meet local authority requirements, B arranges for T to do so.
- (5) B engages a real estate agent to market the units. The real estate agent's procedures require that its engagement documents be signed by the owner of the property to be sold. B arranges for T to execute the documents.
- (6) Because the market is slow, B arranges for several of the units to be rented pending sale and for T to execute the leases.
- (7) When buyers for the units are found, B arranges for the contracts of sale to be executed by T. Similarly, the transfer documents to complete the sales are executed by T at B's direction. T and the buyer in each case agree that the margin scheme is to be applied to work out the GST on the sales.
- (8) At the end of the project, B decides to retain one of the units and instructs T to transfer title to the unit to B. T executes the transfer document which B lodges for registration at the land titles office.
- (9) B later sells that unit to a third party.

<sup>23</sup> Consistent with the declaration of trust, these monies are not furnished as a loan from B to T. Rather, they are furnished by B for T to apply at B's direction.

## *Creation of the trust*

48. In this example, the trust is created by T acquiring the legal title to the land after first executing the declaration of trust. T holds the legal title to the land subject to a bare trust in favour of B from the moment T acquired title to the land. There are no GST implications in respect of the creation of the trust. As the land is subject to the trust from the outset, there is no supply of an interest in the land by T to B. In any case, T does not carry on any enterprise in respect of the land.

49. A less common alternative is that B may first acquire the land and then transfer title to the land to T to hold on a bare trust for B. In those circumstances, there is no taxable supply by B to T. This is because no consideration is provided by T to B in respect of the transfer of the legal title.<sup>24</sup>

50. We consider that Division 72 (associates) does not apply in these circumstances. That is because, even if the provisions of Division 72 are otherwise satisfied, the market value of the supply is, having regard to the circumstances of the transfer of the legal title, nil. In substance, only the bare legal title is transferred. The land remains an asset to be used in B's enterprise. As the bare legal title is of no economic value, the market value is nil.

51. We consider that the analysis to be applied in a GST context is different from that which may apply in other contexts.<sup>25</sup> While the subject matter of the conveyance or other legal instrument may be relevant for income tax purposes (such as capital gains tax) or for stamp duty purposes, for GST purposes a more practical approach is required, focussing upon what is in fact supplied. What is in fact supplied by B in these circumstances is the mere legal title to the property to be held at all times by T on the terms of a bare trust for B.

## *Acquisition of the land*

52. Returning to the example, B acquires the land in the course of its enterprise by causing T to obtain legal title to the land from S, with the purchase monies provided by B, and title at all times is to be held upon a bare trust for B. B is entitled to an input tax credit in respect of the acquisition of the land if the requirements for a creditable acquisition are satisfied.

---

<sup>24</sup> The absence of consideration furnished by a bare trustee upon acceptance of property to be held on trust was confirmed in a stamp duties context by the majority of the High Court (Brennan J dissenting) in *D.K.L.R. Holding Company (No. 2) Pty Ltd v. Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW)* 82 ATC 4125.

<sup>25</sup> For example, while the *D.K.L.R. Holding Company* case is authority for the proposition that no consideration is provided by a trustee accepting a transfer of the legal title trust property to be held on trust for the transferor, we consider that its conclusions regarding the value of the property conveyed do not apply to the GST issue regarding the value of the supply which depends on a proper consideration of the circumstances in which the supply is made.

53. However, for the purposes of this example, it is assumed that B wishes to use the margin scheme in respect of sales of the units and that the supply by S was either not subject to GST or GST was calculated by S under the margin scheme. On that assumption, B is not entitled to an input tax credit on the acquisition of the land.

54. T would not be entitled to an input tax credit in respect of the acquisition of the land, even if the supply by S were a taxable supply on which GST is not calculated under the margin scheme. This is because T does not acquire the title to the land in the course of an enterprise that it carries on.

#### *Other acquisitions*

55. Acquisitions relating to the development and sale of the units, such as construction and real estate agency services, are made by B. Since B acquires those services in the course of its enterprise it is entitled to input tax credits on the acquisitions, subject to the usual rules for input tax credit entitlements. This is so where, although B provides the monies for the acquisitions, legal documents such as contracts or local authority forms, may be executed by T at B's direction.

56. T is not entitled to input tax credits for such acquisitions as it does not make the acquisitions in the course of an enterprise that it carries on in respect of the land.

#### *Leasing of units to third parties*

57. The supplies made by leasing the residential units to third parties pending sale are input taxed supplies. Although T executes the lease agreements as the legal owner of the units, it does so at the direction of B. It is in the course of B's enterprise that the leases are entered into. B may have an increasing adjustment under Division 129, in respect of acquisitions relating to the construction of the units, as a consequence of applying the acquisitions in making input taxed supplies by way of lease.

58. T does not have any Division 129 adjustments as it did not acquire the land or other things in the course of any enterprise it carried on.

#### *Sales to third parties*

59. B makes taxable supplies of the units to third parties. It is in the course of B's enterprise that the sales of the units to third parties are made.

60. Although it is T that executes the transfer documents that transfer title to the units to third party buyers, T is not liable for GST on the sales as it does not execute the transfers in the course of an enterprise that it carries on in respect of the land.

61. Where B previously has had increasing adjustments under Division 129 in respect of acquisitions relating to the construction of the units, then as a consequence of some of the units being leased pending sale, B may have decreasing adjustments after the sales take place. T does not have any decreasing adjustments in respect of these things as it did not acquire the land or other things in the course of any enterprise it carried on.

62. Subject to the usual requirements for the margin scheme, B may apply the margin scheme in working out the GST on the sales on the basis of the difference between the selling price of the units and the relevant proportion of the purchase price for the land. Alternatively, if the acquisition of the land occurred before 1 July 2000, B may wish to calculate the margin on the sales as the difference between the selling price of the units and the relevant proportion of the value of the land at 1 July 2000 calculated in accordance with the applicable margin scheme valuation determination. See paragraphs 78 and 79 of this draft Ruling for guidance regarding the requirement for agreements between suppliers and recipients of supplies to agree in writing to apply the margin scheme.

#### *Transfer of trust property to beneficiary and subsequent sale by beneficiary*

63. T does not make a taxable supply by transferring legal title to the remaining trust property (that is, the unit to be retained by B) to B. This is because the transfer is not made in the course of an enterprise carried on by T in relation to the trust property.

64. If B subsequently sells the unit to a third party, this would represent the first sale of the unit as residential premises.<sup>26</sup> The earlier transfer of the legal title to the unit from T to B is not a sale as there is no consideration for the transfer.

65. If calculating GST on the sale to the third party under the margin scheme, B would calculate the margin for the taxable supply on the basis described in paragraph 62 of this draft Ruling. This is so even though the legal title to the land was held by T. The real property was an asset to be used in B's enterprise.

#### *Change of trustee*

66. Where an asset held on a bare trust is an asset to be used in an enterprise of the beneficiary and this arrangement is to continue with a new trustee, there are no GST implications in respect of the change of legal title to the trust property.

---

<sup>26</sup> 'New residential premises' has the meaning given by section 40-75.

67. If legal title to the trust property is transferred from the outgoing trustee to the new trustee, the transfer is not a taxable supply as it is not made in the course of an enterprise carried on by the outgoing trustee in respect of the trust property. Similarly, the acquisition of the legal title by the new trustee is not a creditable acquisition as it is not made in the course of an enterprise carried on by the new trustee in respect of the trust property.

68. As the asset remains an asset used in the beneficiary's enterprise, the principles set out in this Ruling in respect of adjustments the beneficiary may have and the application of the margin scheme continue to apply despite the change in the trustee of the trust.

#### *Change of beneficiary*

69. Circumstances arise where a trustee that has acted as bare trustee of an asset for one beneficiary carrying on an enterprise in relation to the asset agrees to act as bare trustee of the asset for a new beneficiary.

70. If the beneficiary of a bare trust disposes of its beneficial interest in the trust property in favour of an entity whose interest will be held on a bare trust by the same trustee, the disposal by the outgoing beneficiary is a taxable supply if the requirements of section 9-5 are satisfied. Similarly, the acquisition by the incoming beneficiary is a creditable acquisition if the requirements of section 11-5 are satisfied.

71. For example, if B assigns its interest in the land to a new beneficiary, the assignment is a taxable supply if B is registered or required to be registered and the assignment is made for consideration.

72. Similarly, the new beneficiary makes a creditable acquisition if the interest is acquired in the course or furtherance of its enterprise and the other requirements of section 11-5 are satisfied.

#### ***Tax invoices***<sup>27</sup>

73. This section considers whether tax invoice requirements may be satisfied by the trustee of a bare trust issuing or receiving the tax invoice where the tax invoice relates to a supply or acquisition in the course of an enterprise carried on by the beneficiary in the circumstances described in this Ruling.

74. Broadly, the tax invoice requirements are that:

- tax invoices for a taxable supply must be issued by the supplier: paragraph 29-70(1)(a);

---

<sup>27</sup> The discussion under this heading is also relevant to adjustment notes.

# GSTR 2007/D3

- the supplier of a taxable supply must, within 28 days after the recipient of the supply requests it, give to the recipient a tax invoice for the supply: subsection 29-70(2);
- input tax credits may not be attributed to a tax period unless the recipient of the supply holds a tax invoice: section 29-10;
- other than for certain low value supplies, the tax invoice must generally contain:
  - the name of the supplier and the recipient of the supply: sub-regulation 29-70.01(2) of the A New Tax System (Goods and Services Tax Regulations 1999 (GST Regulations));
  - the ABN of the entity that issues the tax invoice: paragraph 29-70(1)(b) of the GST Act; and
  - the address or ABN of the recipient: subregulation 29-70.01(2) of the GST Regulations.

75. However, section 29-70 gives the Commissioner discretion to treat as a tax invoice a particular document which is not a tax invoice.

76. In accordance with the principles discussed in this Ruling, a supply or acquisition may be made in the course of an enterprise carried on by the beneficiary, such that the beneficiary is liable for GST or entitled to an input tax credit, notwithstanding that title to the relevant property is conveyed by or to a bare trustee for the beneficiary. In those circumstances, as it is the beneficiary that makes the relevant taxable supply or creditable acquisition, if the trustee issues or holds the tax invoice it does so on behalf of the beneficiary.

77. The requirement for the supplier to issue or the beneficiary to hold a tax invoice is satisfied in those circumstances, as the trustee issues or holds the tax invoice on behalf of the beneficiary. For the same reasons, the requirement for the supplier to issue a tax invoice within 28 days after the recipient's request is satisfied by the trustee issuing the tax invoice. If the requirements for a valid tax invoice are satisfied, except that the trust or trustee's details appear as the supplier or recipient instead of the beneficiary's, the Commissioner will treat the document as a tax invoice in accordance with section 29-70.

***Agreement to apply the margin scheme***

78. For a supplier to be able to apply the margin scheme to work out the GST on a taxable supply of real property, the supplier and the recipient must agree in writing that this is to occur.<sup>28</sup> This part considers whether that requirement may be satisfied where a bare trustee executes the agreement, either in connection with the supply or the acquisition of the real property.

79. In accordance with the principles discussed in this Ruling, a supply or acquisition may be made in the course of an enterprise carried on by the beneficiary, notwithstanding that title to the relevant property is conveyed by or to a bare trustee for the beneficiary. In those circumstances, if the trustee agrees in writing that the margin scheme is to be applied, it does so as agent for the beneficiary.<sup>29</sup> The requirement for the supplier and the recipient to agree in writing to the margin scheme being applied is satisfied in those circumstances, as the trustee's agreement is provided on behalf of the beneficiary.

***Agreement that a supply is a supply of a going concern***

80. For a supply to be GST-free as a supply of a going concern, the supplier and the recipient must agree that the supply is a supply of a going concern. This part of the Ruling considers whether that requirement may be satisfied where a bare trustee executes the agreement in connection with the supply or the acquisition.

81. In accordance with the principles discussed in this Ruling, a supply or acquisition may be made in the course of an enterprise carried on by the beneficiary, such that the beneficiary is liable for any GST or entitled to any input tax credit, notwithstanding that title to the relevant property is conveyed by or to a bare trustee for the beneficiary. In those circumstances, if the trustee agrees in writing that the supply is a supply of a going concern, it does so as agent for the beneficiary.<sup>30</sup> The requirement for the supplier or recipient, as the case may be, to agree to the supply being a supply of a going concern is satisfied in those circumstances.

---

<sup>28</sup> Subsection 75-5(1). However, for supplies made under contracts entered into before 29 June 2005, or made pursuant to rights or options granted before that day, such a written agreement is not required.

<sup>29</sup> We do not consider it a contradiction that the supply or acquisition itself is made by the beneficiary in the course or furtherance of its enterprise but the particular activity of agreeing that the margin scheme applies to that supply or acquisition, when performed by the trustee, is carried out as agent for the beneficiary. It is necessary to examine each activity separately when considering whether an entity carries out an activity as agent for another entity.

<sup>30</sup> For the same reasons set out in the preceding footnote.

## Your comments

82. We invite you to comment on this draft Goods and Services Tax Ruling. Please forward your comments to the contact officer by the due date. (Note: the Tax Office prepares a compendium of comments for the consideration of the relevant Rulings Panel or relevant Tax officers. The Tax Office may use a version (names and identifying information removed) of the compendium in providing responses to persons providing comments. Please advise if you do not want your comments included in the latter version of the compendium.)

**Due date:** 11 January 2008  
**Contact officer:** Garry King  
**Email address:** Garry.King@ato.gov.au  
**Telephone:** (07) 3213 8134  
**Facsimile:** (07) 3213 8588  
**Address:** 10 Banfield Street  
 Chermside QLD 4032

## Detailed contents list

83. Below is a detailed contents list for this draft Goods and Services Tax Ruling:

|  | <b>Paragraph</b> |
|--|------------------|
| <b>What this Ruling is about</b>         | <b>1</b>         |
| <b>Date of effect</b>                    | <b>9</b>         |
| <b>Background</b>                        | <b>11</b>        |
| <b>Legislative context</b>               | <b>14</b>        |
| <b>Ruling with explanation</b>           | <b>24</b>        |
| General principles – agency              | 25               |
| General principles – bare trusts         | 29               |
| <i>A cycle of transactions</i>           | 47               |
| <i>Creation of the trust</i>             | 48               |
| <i>Acquisition of the land</i>           | 52               |
| <i>Other acquisitions</i>                | 55               |
| <i>Leasing of units to third parties</i> | 57               |
| <i>Sales to third parties</i>            | 59               |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Transfer of trust property to beneficiary and subsequent sale by beneficiary</i> | 63        |
| <i>Change of trustee</i>  | 66        |
| <i>Change of beneficiary</i>  | 69        |
| <i>Tax invoices</i>   | 73        |
| <i>Agreement to apply the margin scheme</i>   | 78        |
| <i>Agreement that a supply is a supply of a going concern</i>                       | 80        |
| <b>Your comments</b>  | <b>82</b> |
| <b>Detailed contents list</b>   | <b>83</b> |

**Commissioner of Taxation**

14 November 2007

*Previous drafts:*

Not previously issued as a draft

*Related Rulings/Determinations:*GSTR 1999/1; GSTR 2000/37;  
MT 2006/1*Subject references:*

- acquisition of assets
- goods and services tax
- GST input tax credits and creditable acquisitions
- GST invoices
- GST margin scheme
- GST sale of real property
- GST supplies and acquisitions

*Legislative references:*

- ANTS(GST)A 1999
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 9-5
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 9-10
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 9-20
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 9-20(1)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 11-5
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 11-10
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 11-15
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 11-15(1)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-10
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-10(3)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-70
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-70(1)(a)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-70(1)(b)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 29-70(2)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 Subdiv 38-J
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 40-75

- ANTS(GST)A 1999 Div 75
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 75-5(1)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 Subdiv 153-B
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 184-1(1)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 184-1(1)(g)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 184-1(2)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 184-1(3)
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 195-1
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 Div 72
- ANTS(GST)A 1999 Div 129
- ANTS(GST)R 1999 29-70.01(2)
- TAA 1953 Sch 1 105-60

*Case references:*

- Beynon and Partners v. Customs and Excise Commissioners [2004] 4 All ER 1091; [2004] BTC 5794; [2005] 1 WLR 86
- D.K.L.R. Holding Co (No. 2) Pty Ltd v. Commissioner of Stamp Duties (NSW) (1982) 56 ALJR 287; (1982) 40 ALR 1; (1982) 82 ATC 4125; (1982) 12 ATR 874; (1982) 149 CLR 431
- Herdegen v. Federal Commissioner of Taxation (1988) 84 ALR 271; (1988) 88 ATC 4995; (1988) 20 ATR 24
- Ingram v. Inland Revenue Commissioners [1997] 4 All ER 395
- Palette Shoes Pty Ltd v. Krohn (1937) 11 ALJ 159; [1937] ALR 432; (1937) 58 CLR 1
- Reliance Carpet Company Pty Ltd v. Federal Commissioner of

Draft Goods and Services Tax Ruling

# GSTR 2007/D3

---

Status: **draft only – for comment**

Page 18 of 18

---

- Taxation [2007] FCAFC 99;  
2007 ATC 4650
  - Saga Holidays Ltd v.  
Commissioner of Taxation  
[2006] FCAFC 191; 2006 ATC  
4841; 64 ATR 602; 156 FCR  
256
  - Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC  
of T (2005) 220 ALR 550;  
(2005) 2005 ATC 4796; (2005)  
60 ATR 502; [2005] ALMD  
8602; [2005] FCA 1166
  - Sterling Guardian Pty Ltd v. FC  
of T (2006) 228 ALR 712;  
(2006) 2006 ATC 4227; (2006)  
62 ATR 119; (2006) 149 FCR  
255; [2007] ALMD 1419; [2006]  
FCAFC 12
- Other references:*
- Halsbury's Laws of England, 4<sup>th</sup>  
edition, Vol 48, 'Trusts'
- 

ATO references

NO: 2007/13985

ISSN: 1443-5160

ATOlaw topic: Goods and Services Tax ~~ Rules for entity types ~~ trusts